



CORPORATION OF THE TOWNSHIP OF ESQUIMALT

Municipal Hall
1229 Esquimalt Road
Esquimalt, B.C. V9A 3P1

Legislation Details (With Text)

File #: 19-120 **Version:** 1 **Name:**
Type: Staff Report **Status:** Passed
File created: 3/11/2019 **In control:** Council
On agenda: 3/18/2019 **Final action:** 3/18/2019
Title: Heritage Alteration Permit Application - 1379 Esquimalt Road / 520 Foster Street (St. Peter and St. Paul's Church), Staff Report DEV-19-026

Sponsors:

Indexes:

Code sections:

Attachments: 1. Appendix A - HAP00003 - St Peter & St Pauls - 1379 Esquimalt Road, 2. Appendix B - Air photo, Bylaw No 2377, Statement of Significance, 3. Appendix C - Letter from No 10 Architectural Group and Plans, 4. Appendix D - Heritage Review Committee, 5. Appendix E - Public Comment

Date	Ver.	Action By	Action	Result
3/18/2019	1	Council	approved	Pass

REQUEST FOR DECISION

DATE: March 13, 2019

Report No. DEV-19-026

TO: Laurie Hurst, Chief Administrative Officer

FROM: Karen Hay, Planner and Bill Brown, Director of Development Services

SUBJECT:

Heritage Alteration Permit Application - 1379 Esquimalt Road / 520 Foster Street (St. Peter and St. Paul's Church)

RECOMMENDATION:

That Council resolves that **Heritage Alteration Permit No. HAP00003** authorizing a new entrance to the heritage church, that will connect the building to the new 'ministry centre', consistent with the architectural plans provided by Number Ten Architectural Group, stamped "Received March 12, 2019", to be located at 1379 Esquimalt Road / 520 Foster Street (St. Peter and St. Paul's Church) [PID 024-848-905; Lot A (DD EP75276), Suburban Lot 27, Esquimalt District, Plan 5092] be approved.

RELEVANT POLICY:

Local Government Act - Part 15 - Heritage Conservation

Official Community Plan Bylaw, 2018, No. 2922

Zoning Bylaw, 1992, No. 2050

Heritage Designation (1379 Esquimalt Road) Bylaw, 1999, No. 2377

Parking Bylaw, 1992, No. 2011

Development Application Procedures and Fees Bylaw, 2012, No. 2791
Advisory Planning Commission Bylaw, 2012, No. 2792
Subdivision and Development Control Bylaw, 1997, No. 2175

STRATEGIC RELEVANCE:

This Request for Decision does not directly relate to a specific strategic objective.

BACKGROUND:

Appendix A: HAP00003 - St. Peter & St. Paul's Church - 1379 Esquimalt Road
Appendix B: Air photo, Designation Bylaw No. 2377, Statement of Significance
Appendix C: Letter from No. 10 Architectural and Plans
Appendix D: Heritage Review Committee
Appendix E: Public Comment

Purpose of the Application:

CitySpaces Consulting on behalf of the owner of St. Peter and St. Paul's Church (The Anglican Synod of the Diocese of British Columbia), is requesting a Heritage Alteration Permit to facilitate the development of the subject property. The proposed development of a new ministry centre with 24 units of affordable housing includes a connection between the new building and the heritage designated church through a new entrance on the south side of the church. As the church is protected by a heritage designation bylaw, a heritage alteration permit is required before any changes to the exterior of the church can be made.

Context:

Applicant: Deane Strongitharm, CitySpaces Consulting
Owner: The Anglican Synod of the Diocese of British Columbia
Architect: Barry Cosgrave, Number Ten Architectural Group
Property Size: Metric: 6284 m2
Existing Land Use: Church, Parish Hall, Senior's Multiple Family Residence, Cemetery
Surrounding Land Uses:
North: Multiple Family Residential
South: Multiple Family Residential
West: Multiple Family Residential
East: Multiple Family Residential
Existing Zoning: Comprehensive Development District No. 23 [CD-23]
Existing OCP Designation: St. Peter and St. Paul's

Heritage:

The proposed ministry centre would attach to the southern elevation of the heritage designated church through a new vestibule that would provide access both to the outdoors and to the new Ministry Centre. This new access would require the replacement of one of the church's stained glass windows with a new exit door accessing the new vestibule and some alteration to the existing ship-lap siding. The roof of new vestibule would also require a small alteration to the roof of the existing church where the peak rises above the eave of the church roof.

The existing church is protected by Heritage Designation (1379 Esquimalt Road) Bylaw, 1999, No. 2377 [Appendix B] which requires that 'no person shall alter, remove or take action that would damage or change the said existing church building', with the exception of 'general maintenance and

upkeep of the exterior' and 'interior renovations'. The Statement of Significance [Appendix B] for the church identifies the following elements that will be impacted by the proposed addition, as contributing to the heritage character of the historic building: the steeply pitched roof, the tripartite pointed-arch windows, the simple ship-lap siding with black corner boards and accents, the footprint of the church, and the memorial stained glass windows.

The original design of the Ministry Centre's connection to the heritage church (proposed in 2018) raised concerns for Council and they advised the applicant to consider other options for the site. The applicant established a 'Heritage Review Committee' to provide advice on options for the new Ministry Centre siting that would minimize the impact on the church's heritage character-defining elements. The committee's process and decision are outlined in the letter from Number 10 Architectural Group and the letter from the chair of the committee [Appendix C and D].

Design Review Committee [DRC]:

The DRC reviewed the application on March 6, 2019. The committee made the following recommendation:

That the Esquimalt Design Review Committee [DRC] recommends that the Heritage Alteration Permit Application authorizing a new entrance to the heritage church that will connect the building to the new 'ministry centre' consistent with the architectural plans provided by Number Ten Architectural Group, stamped "Received February 15, 2019", to be located at 1379 Esquimalt Road / 520 Foster Street (St. Peter and St. Paul's Church) [PID 024-848-905; Lot A (DD EP75276), Suburban Lot 27, Esquimalt District, Plan 5092], be forwarded to Council with the recommendation for approval as it respects the significant heritage components of the building.

ISSUES:

1. Rationale for Selected Option

The applicant has undertaken a thoughtful process with the formation of a 'Heritage Review Committee', composed of members of the church congregation and community members with an interest in heritage and accessibility, who worked together for four meetings, to recommend the most acceptable solution to changes proposed for the church.

The Design Review Committee recommended approval of the heritage alteration permit application.

The new vestibule entrance to the heritage church, with connection to the new Ministry Centre will have an impact on some of the character-defining elements of the heritage church; but the development of the new Ministry Centre with better accessibility and washroom facilities enhances the opportunities to keep this church and congregation viable in the future. The loss of the church congregation would be most detrimental to the heritage value of this building.

2. Organizational Implications

This Request for Decision has no significant organizational implications.

3. Financial Implications

This Request for Decision has no significant financial implications.

4. Sustainability & Environmental Implications

This Request for Decision has no significant Sustainability & Environmental implications.

5. Communication & Engagement

As this is a Heritage Alteration Permit application requiring no variances, the Local Government Act does not require that notification be provided.

The applicant and owners of the property undertook a thoughtful engagement process with the creation of their 'Heritage Review Committee' that met four times in public meetings and then also hosted a public open house on February 9, 2019.

ALTERNATIVES:

1. That Council resolves that Heritage Alteration Permit No. HAP00003 [Appendix A] be approved.
2. That Council deny Heritage Alteration Permit No. HAP00003 [Appendix A], and provide direction to the applicant.